#### REPORT

#### OF EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION ON THE RESULTS OF THE INSTITUTIONAL ASSESSMENT OF WEST KAZAKHSTAN HIGHER MEDICAL COLLEGE IN COMPLIANCE WITH THE STANDARDS OF INSTITUTIONAL ACCREDITATION OF TECHNICAL AND VOCATIONAL EDUCATION **ORGANIZATIONS**

external expert evaluation period: April 7-9, 2021

#### 1. Composition of the External Expert Commission

In accordance with ECAQA Order No. 8 dated March 11, 2021, an External Expert Commission was formed to conduct external evaluation procedures within the framework of institutional and specialized accreditation from April 07 to April 09, 2021 of LLP "West Kazakhstan Higher Medical College" (hereinafter referred to as the college) in the following composition:



#### **Chairperson of the External Expert Commission** TOKBERGENOVA GULMIRA TELMANOVNA, Candidate of Pedagogical Sciences, Honorary Worker of Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan, excellence in health care of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Director of LLP "Higher Medical College "Interdent" tel.: +77016557484, e-mail: tokberg enova@bk.ru.



Foreign expert OLEINIKOVA TATIANA ANATOLIEVNA, Ph.D., Head of Education Quality Management Department Educational and methodical management, associate professor of the department

FME "Kursk State Medical University"

Tel.: +7 (919) 272 22 74, e-mail: ol tanja@mail.ru



National academic expert KUMAROVA ALTYNAI BALTABAYEVNA, Deputy Director for teaching and educational work SPE on REM "Taldykorgan Higher Medical College" tel .: +77058881798, e-mail: <u>altynay\_kumarova@mail.ru</u>



National academic expert
ABZHANOVA ZHANAR SOLTANOVNA,
Deputy Director for Scientific and Methodological work
LLP "Republican Higher Medical College"
tel .: +7 7475576783,

e-mail: <u>z.abzhanova@mail.ru</u>



National academic expert EVDOMASHCHENKO TAMARA VITALIEVNA, general practitioner, teacher of special disciplines MSE "Kostanay Higher Medical College" Health Department of Akimat of Kostanay region tel .: 8776 702 85 85,

e-mail: tamaradubina@mail.ru



Expert - employers' representative ESLYASHOVA DINA MURATOVNA, chief nurse SPE on REM "City Polyclinic No. 2", Uralsk Tel .: 87058112598,

e-mail: dina\_mirkiyasova@mail.ru



Expert - student representative BASEROV RUSLAN BEKTEMIROVICH, 4th year student in the specialty "Medical care" PI "Ural Medical College" Maksat " Tel :: 8 776 2267153,

e-mail: basirov.ruslan@list.ru



ECAQA Observer
UMAROVA MAKPAL ALDIBEKOVNA,
Head of Accreditation and Monitoring Department
"Eurasian Centre for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher
Education and Health Care".
tel .: +7 747 5609212, e-mail: info@ecaqa.org

The work of the EEC was carried out in accordance with the Regulations on the EEC (Order of the ECAQA Director General No. 4

dated February 13, 2017).

The EEC report contains an assessment of institutional accreditation for compliance with the Standards of accreditation of educational programmes in medical and pharmaceutical specialties of technical and vocational education, recommendations of the EEC on further improving the implementation of training programmes for the WKHMC.

#### 2.General part the final report of the EEC

### 2.1 Representation of the West Kazakhstan Higher Medical College (hereinafter - WHMC)

West Kazakhstan Higher Medical College is one of the oldest educational institutions in the country. The history of the West Kazakhstan Medical College begins in 1916. At the end of 1916, the newspaper "Uralskiy Listok" published an announcement: "Zemskaya feldsher-obstetric school opens in the city of Uralsk on November 1, 1916, the course of training for feldshers - 3 years, for feldshers-feldfeldricians - 4 years. Scholarships are awarded for the best students".

On the instructions of the All-Russian Central Executive Committee on May 14, 1923, the Ural Feldsher-Obstetric School was transferred to the city of Orenburg, where it remained until 1929 and received the name of the "Kazakh Regional Medical College".

In 1929, the medical college was again transferred to the city of Uralsk.

Since 1954, the name of the paramedic and obstetric school has changed again, it was renamed into a medical school. This name survived until June 14, 1996. Since 1996, this educational institution has been called the "West Kazakhstan Medical College".

For more than a century of its existence, the educational institution has trained and graduated more than 23,000 mid-level medical workers in the following specialties: dentists, paramedics, midwives, children's nurses, sanitary paramedics, dental technicians, dental assistants, paramedics, laboratory assistants, nurses. More than 2,000 graduates received honors diplomas. Some of them received higher medical education, became scientists and heads of medical services and departments.

Other graduates successfully work in various medical and medical institutions in our country and abroad (Cuba, Germany, USA, Canada, Israel, etc.)

In various years, famous scientists worked - academician K. Zhumaliev, I.M. Malecha, Z.M. Rachmanin, F. Ya. Tripurov, A.A. Koblik, as well as doctors known in Kazakhstan - surgeon N.T. Alibaev, infectious disease specialist K.D. Tazhimanov, S.A. Lebedev, obstetrician-gynecologist I.I. Berlyand, S.P. psychiatrist Pisman, I.S. Edelzon, T.V. Cheusov, V.O. Miller, L.N. Anshakova and Dr.

There are many scientists among our graduates, whose names are known throughout Kazakhstan:

Imasheva Rozaliya Galievna - Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Academician - a graduate of our educational institution, the first Kazakh woman, a child psychiatrist, worked at the Alma-Ata State Medical Institute.

Zhumatov Hamza Zhumatovich - Soviet virologist, Academy of Medical Sciences of the USSR, studied in 1929 at the Kazakh Regional Medical School.

Karakulov Ishanbai Karakulovich - studied at the Kazakh Regional Technical School in 1929 - 1931. - a famous Soviet epidemiologist, organizer of public health, a corresponding member of the Academy of Medical Sciences of the USSR, Kazakh SSR, Honored Scientist of the Kazakh SSR, Karakalpak SSR.

Tyurin Nikolai Alekseevich - in 1939 he entered the paramedic department of the Ural dental school. In August 1941, when he was 18, he went to the front. In 1952 he graduated from the Moscow Medical Institute, worked in Moscow at the Peoples' Friendship University named after Patrice Lumumba, was the dean of the medical faculty, doctor of medical sciences, academician.

The leaders of the educational institution were: G.I. Koltsov (1916-1920), A.V. Genke (1920-1922), V.S. Ponomarev (1922), I.V. Stepanov (1922-1923), M.A. Kutin (1923-1924), M.T. Batalov (1924-1931), I.S. Zobnin (1931-1932), I.Z. Shnibekov (1932-1936), M. Sundetkaliev

(1937-1938), E.A. Shipulin (1937-1938), M.G. Sokolov (1938-1940), P.A. Pryanin (1940-1941), R.S. Podolskaya (1941-1944), E.I. Shchelkov (1944-1954), N.T. Alibaev (1954-1960), A.V. Tikhonov (1960-1979), A.N. Ibatov (1979-1984), M.K. Bergen (1984-2012). They worked hard and left an indelible mark on the development of the regional health care sector and in the training of medical personnel. Since 2012, the college was headed by N. M. Shumbalov, candidate of medical sciences, associate professor of the Department of Social Hygiene and Health Organization, who for many years previously worked as head of the department, dean, vice-rector of the West Kazakhstan State Medical University named after M. Ospanov in Aktobe, "Excellence in Education", "Excellence in Health care of the RK"

Since 2018, the college has been headed by Irmenov Kamidolla Mutigollaevich, candidate of medical sciences, honorary professor of the NJSC Asfendiyarov KazNMU, who has been the head of health care in EKR for more than 10 years.

The legal address of the college: 090009, West Kazakhstan region, Uralsk, Zhangirkhana, 67. Phones: 8 (711) 2-24-31-34, email address<a href="https://www.zko-medcollege.kz/">https://www.zko-medcollege.kz/</a> Founder - EKR Health Department. The legal address of the founder: 090000, Uralsk, Dostyk avenue, house 201.

#### 2.2 Information on previous accreditation

In 2016, the college successfully passed institutional accreditation (certificate IA No. 018 dated May 31, 2016).

# 2.3 Analysis of the self-assessment report of WKHMC for compliance with the Standards of institutional accreditation of organizations of technical and vocational education

Institutional Accreditation Report presented on 169 pages of main text, 26 pages of attachments.

The report is characterized by completeness of answers to all 9 accreditation standards, structuredness taking into account the recommendations of the ECAQA TVE Study Programme Self-Assessment Guidelines, as well as by the internal unity of information provided by the accredited college. The report is accompanied by an accompanying a letter signed by the director of WKHMC, Ph.D. Irmenova K.M. confirming the accuracy of the information and data contained in the report.

The report contains a list of 12 members of the internal self-assessment commission, indicating the responsibility of each employee, information about the representative of the organization responsible for conducting the institutional self-assessment, Deputy Director for Academic Affairs Almagambetova G.I. The chairperson of the working group on preparation for institutional accreditation is Deputy Director for Academic Affairs Almagambetova G.I.

Institutional self-assessment carried out on the basis of the order No. 735 dated 12/08/2020 "On the appointment of the composition of the internal commission for drawing up a college self-assessment report."

The working group on the preparation of the self-assessment report has done a certain amount of work: the key areas of institutional activity in the field of vocational education, tasks for the implementation of educational programmes have been analyzed, the necessary information has been collected in accordance with the accreditation standards for educational programmes in medical and pharmaceutical specialties of technical and vocational education (hereinafter referred to as text - ECAQA Accreditation Standards); a thorough analysis, updating and addition of methodological and educational materials was carried out, their content is reflected in the report. The content of the Self-Assessment Report is structured in accordance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards and includes a description of strengths, areas for improvement for each of the 9 standards.

The database, applications are presented in full, sequentially and there are references to them in the text of the report. The report is written in a competent language, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable, the tables contain references in the text and are consecutively numbered.

Thus, the college's institutional self-assessment report provides objective, detailed, structured information on all activities in accordance with ECAQA accreditation standards.

Based on the analysis of the self-assessment report by external experts, it was determined that the content of the self-assessment report was structured in accordance with the ECAQA accreditation standards and the recommendations of the Self-Assessment Guidelines.

The report is written voluminously, competently, the sequence and logic in the description of the standards is observed, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable, the tables contain links in the text and are numbered continuously. There are links to regulations, model rules, regulations, teaching documents, website pages <a href="https://www.zko-medcollege.kz/">https://www.zko-medcollege.kz/</a>

Self-assessment and description were carried out in accordance with ECAQA management standards and answers to the questions formulated in the Self-assessment Guidelines were received. All standards contain the real practice of the organization for training students, reasoned data, examples of the implementation of the educational programme, national and international events, methodological support of the educational programme, confirming compliance with the requirements of institutional accreditation standards. The description of the activities of the WKHMC is quite complete and updated in terms of the number of students, teachers, administration, information on selection and admission, training results, results of knowledge and skills assessment, material and technical base, contractual obligations with partners, financial information, plans for development and improvement, etc.

The Opinion for each of the 9 Institutional Accreditation Standards includes a description of the strengths and areas for improvement identified by the college. Prior to the external visit, ECAQA experts reviewed the self-assessment reports and based on the expert evaluations provided to the college, the reports were revised.

Thus, the institutional self-assessment report contains objective, detailed, structured information on all activities in accordance with the ECAQA institutional accreditation standards.

#### 3. External expert evaluation

#### 3.1. Description of external expert evaluation

External expert work on the institutional assessment of the WKHMC (hereinafter referred to as the college) was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for the external assessment of educational organizations and educational programmes of ECAQA (approved by order of the Director General of NEI "Eurasian Centre for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health care" No. 8 dated 11.03. 2021) and according to the programme and schedule approved on March 15, 2021 by the Director General of ECAQA Sarsenbayeva S.S. and agreed with the chairperson of the EEC Ph.D. Tokbergenova G.T. and director Irmenov K.M. An external expert evaluation of institutional accreditation for compliance with the Standards for Accreditation of educational programmes in medical and pharmaceutical specialties of technical and vocational education (TVE) ECAQA began on March 15, 2021.

To obtain objective information on expert evaluation, the EEC members used the following methods: interviews with management and administrative staff, interviews with students, observation, study of the website, interviewing employees of various structural units, teachers, online questioning of teachers and students during the period from 04/05/07/04/2021, a review of resources in the context of the implementation of accreditation standards, the study of educational and methodological documents for accredited educational programmes.

On the part of the college staff, the presence of all persons indicated in the visit programme and according to the lists of interview sites (Attachment 2-5) is ensured.

**04/05/2021** A preliminary meeting of the members of the External Expert Commission was held online under the leadership of the ECAQA Director general Sarsenbayeva S.S and the chairmanship of Tokbergenova Gulmira Telmanovna. An acquaintance of experts took place, responsibility is distributed among the members of the EEC. Self-assessment reports brief:

discussion of key issues, including the results of expert evaluation of self-assessment reports, familiarization of EEC members with recommendations for self-assessment reports, discussion of a list of documents that must be additionally requested from the college for self-assessment validation. The programme and schedule of external expert evaluation and planning of the work of the EEC members were discussed.

**First day of visit 04/07/2021**A preliminary meeting of the EEC ECAQA members took place. During the organizational meeting chaired by Tokbergenova Gulmira Telmanovna, the programme of external expert evaluation was specified and the first day of the visit is planned.

In accordance with the programme and schedule of external expert work, members of the EEC held a meeting and interview with the management of the college. There was a presentation of the members of the EEC, familiarization with the goals of external expert assessment. Director Irmenov K.M. made a presentation about the college, which reflects the strategy, mission and vision, cooperation with medical universities and colleges from far and near abroad, agreements with clinical bases in Almaty, qualitative and quantitative characteristics of educational programmes in specialties, social work, employment of graduates, composition of teachers and resources for these programmes, the work of the National Assembly. The interview questions with the director of the college related to the relationship of the mission of the college with the mission and goals of accredited educational programmes, how much funding for programmes by year, how is the search and recruitment of teachers carried out and what development programmes exist (teacher's schools and young teachers' schools, internships), prospects for further development of educational programmes. Director Irmenov K.M. exhaustive answers were given, a vision and key activities were given for the implementation of the college development strategy, practical and scientific activities, and how these tasks are integrated with educational activities for the training of specialists in TPE and post-secondary education.

This interview validated accreditation standards 1.8 and 9.

At a meeting of EEC members with the academic leadership of the college, departments responsible for the admission and release of students (Almagambetova G.I., Shunaeva B.K., Temiralieva N.A., Mukhambetzhanova A.S.) experts for the validation of standards No. 2, 4 an interview was held on the staffing of programmes, career guidance work, statistical information on the admission and release of specialists for 5 years, an analysis of the effectiveness of training programmes, development prospects, features of training in a pandemic, the organization of distance education and monitoring of employment.





Photo 1. EEC conducts an interview with management college and department heads

Under the external expert evaluation programme, members EEC met with the heads of departments organizing educational and methodological support of educational programmes and student practice (Attachment).

The interview was conducted to validate and verify the data of the self-assessment report for standards 2,3,7. Experts asked questions about planning, reviewing, approving and implementing programmes, evaluating programmes, using test and measurement tools to assess knowledge, skills and abilities of students, academic counseling and social, material support for students, and analyzing the effectiveness of training programmes. The members of the working group were

interviewed about the contribution of each to the self-assessment and the preparation of the self-assessment report. In total, 4 heads of departments and 7 heads of the TCS took part in the meeting.

Almagambetova G.I. the executive secretary of the selection committee spoke aboutstrategies and tactics for recruiting students for this specialty (career guidance work in schools, image work with the release of information triplets, information on the website and social networks are actively used). An interview with the head of the "Applied Baccalaureate" department, G. Alibayeva, allowed the members of the EEC to ask questions about the contingent of the department, the prospects and problems of developing international cooperation and motivating students to obtain this qualification.

Interviews on educational and social work with students made it possible to validate standards 4,8,9. During the conversation, members of the EEC asked questions about supporting and advising students on personal issues, the formation and development of communication skills, leadership, events, projects held in the college, volunteerism and student feedback.

Members of the EEC visited the museum, the college dormitory, located across the street, the first-aid post, the sports and assembly halls. The information support department, consisting of three computer classes, was examined (212 computers connected to the Internet and 6 interactive panels are involved in the educational process), in which the head of the department Gupranov K.S. demonstrated DEP, the base of test items available for all educational programmes.

Then there was an inspection of the library with a reading room for 80 seats. Head of the library Kurmanbaeva K.M. demonstrated the provision of educational programmes with literature in the Kazakh and Russian languages, the periodicity of updating the literary fund and the electronic database. On the same day, a meeting was held with the responsible support services (RSS), the chief accountant, the inspector of the personnel department and the person in charge of the QMS of the college Musina K.M., documents and audit results were studied.

During interviews with the head of the personnel department Nurmukhambetova, members of the EEC asked questions about the personnel policy of the college and the procedure for admitting teachers, their monitoring (advanced training, certification, training in teaching methods, quality control of classes).

On the same day, experts interviewed teachers online and offline, observing distancing and masking. The foreign expert participated remotely (ZOOM record in ECAQA affairs). Teachers answered questions about satisfaction with working conditions, wages, material incentives (bonuses, additional payments for leadership, methodological work, publications), talked about teacher development activities, noted the high corporate culture in the college and ethical leadership. All noted that equipment is being purchased, great attention is being paid to improving the qualifications of teachers in terms of professional competence. The experts received answers about the teacher training programme, the financing of this training, the availability of certification for teachers in teaching methods...

This interview and study of the documentation allowed the experts to validate the data in the self-assessment report against the standard 2,4,5.



Photo 2. Interview with heads of structural divisions responsible for recruiting, hiring, and developing teachers

The second day of the visit: 04/08/2021 In order to validate standards 2, 6 and 7, experts visited practical bases in all areas of training. For the high-quality implementation of educational practice, educational and production training, professional practice, the college concluded contracts with 41 medical and pharmaceutical organizations of the region: 29 city, 12 district, which organized the work of 10 classrooms, namely, the SPE on the REM "Regional multidisciplinary hospital" and the SPE on the REM "City multidisciplinary hospital" (Attachment 4).

When visiting the clinics, a meeting was held with the head physician Murzakhmetov A.Z., and the head nurse Karakuzova G.A., the clinic of the SPE on the REM "City multidisciplinary hospital", as well as the main and senior nurses of the SPE on the REM "Regional multidisciplinary hospital", and senior nurses Kalieva S.G. and Muldakhmetova Zh.S. All of them are graduates of WKHMC. During the conversation, positive feedback was received on the quality of training of graduates, on the joint work being carried out: participation in the development of a mission, a strategic plan, adjusting educational programmes, participation in the FSA as examiners and mentors in conducting educational and industrial practices. Training rooms organized in clinics attended. At the time of the visit, the equipment of the rooms was taken to the college due to the pandemic.

On the same day, interviews were held with students of all educational programmes of the college and student activists. The interview was attended by 30 full-time students with respect to distance and mask mode. Foreign expert T.A. Oleinikova participated in interviews with distance learners on the ZOOM platform (video recorded in ECAQA files). Students actively answered questions from ECAQA experts: on material incentives (discounts for studies), social support (mentors, staff psychologist, student guide), participation in SRW, college events, learning satisfaction, communication with teachers, management attitude (director, head department, chairperson of the TCS), questionnaires. Student activists talked about their goals and objectives, how they help first-time students to adapt to their studies, assist teachers in organizing events and volunteer work. Experts made conclusionsorganized at a high level.



Photo 3. Interview with students and attendance of the class

An online interview was conducted with stakeholders of the educational process representatives of practical health care (employers), in which 3 people took part (Utepova G.G., SPE on REM "City polyclinic No. 6", Aimurzieva M.K. LLP " Medical centre ", Toksanov EVSPE on REM" Regional oncological dispensary "). Reviews about the quality of graduate training are satisfactory (Attachment 6).

On the same day, in order to assess educational resources, an excursion to the simulation centre was held under the guidance of responsible employees (Syzdykova D.M., Shunaeva B.K.). They demonstrated the presence of dummy phantoms, robotic dummies for nursing and emergency care. Then there was a review of resources - the material base of educational programmes, classrooms, laboratories, classrooms, computer classes and IT equipment.





Photo 4. Overview of educational resources

The college has 60 classrooms, of which 41 are special disciplines, 9 laboratories and 3 computer labs. The percentage of equipment for preclinical practice rooms in all specialties is 95%.

For the validation of standards 2.3.6, members of the EEC attended the lessons of teachers: M.M. Baktygalieva. specialty "Medical care", 0301013 Feldsher, Topic: "Surgical and inflammatory processes of the kidneys, Kidney cancer, Surgical diseases of the external genital organs" Students: group EI - 33;

in the specialty "Nursing", 0302043 Nurse of general practice, teacher Dyusenbaeva Aigerim Zhangeldievna. Topic: "Survey of women according to the list of guaranteed volumes of free medical care. Precancerous diseases of the breast. Malignant and benign breast tumors "withstudents: group MI - 35;

in the specialty 0302043 "General practice nurse", teacher Sandugash Bakitovna Semgalieva. Topic: "Cardiopulmonary resuscitation. Providing emergency care in case of emergency in children "students: group SD - 32;

specialty 0301023 "midwife", teacher Nabigalieva Makhabbat Dauletkalievna. Topic: "Emergencies in diseases of the digestive and urinary organs" students: group AI - 31;

Nursing in therapy: teacher Ermekovu Aselim Bulekbaevna Topic: "Rheumatoid arthritis. Osteoarthritis", students: group MI - 33; students: group FT - 31. All attended classes are provided with a working curriculum, control and measuring tools, handouts, equipment for individual practice of practical skills. 100% of the students were present in compliance with the sanitary epidemiological regime.





Photo 4. Members of the EEC when attending the conference and studying the documentation

Further, members of the EEC in offline mode in compliance with all measures of sanitary and epidemiological requirements together with a foreign expert in the online format Oleinikova T.A. took part in the final conference of prospecting and research works (SIW) on the topic "Viral infection - the problem of the XXI century. COVID-19" college students. The conference was held with the participation of students of the Kazan Medical College in the online format.

At the end of the second day of the visit, the experts examined the college documentation: constituent documents, regulations on the organization of the educational process, job descriptions, plans for all structural units, protocols, reports, projects, SRW results, publications, schedule, RUEs, EMCD, syllabuses, CMMs, didactic materials, regulations, journals of attendance and progress, electronic journals, work plans, reports, questionnaires and results of questionnaire processing, financial documents, etc. To obtain evidence of compliance with the standards for accreditation and verification of the data of the self-assessment report, external experts requested documents, video presentation, video about resources (archived in ECAQA documents), according to the recommendations of the Self-assessment Guidelines.

#### The third day of the visit: 04/09/2021.

An interview was held with those responsible for interaction with Kazakh universities and international cooperation - Almagambetova G.I., responsible for applied bachelor's degree Alibayeva G.A., and postgraduate education Syzdykova D.M. All members of the listed structural units made brief presentations and provided the members of the EEC with documentation in the form of: contracts, memoranda, theses, publications, achievements.

In total, the college implements 5 memorandums with the University of Applied Sciences JAMK Finland, Kaunas Lithuanian University of Health Latvia, Carmel MedCurator Haifa Israel. NJSC Kaz NMU named after S.D. Asfendiyarova, JSC Kazakh Medical University of Continuing Education, Samara Medical College named after N. Lyapina, West Kazakhstan Medical University named after M. Ospanov.

Since the signing of Memorandums with universities, since 2019, active training has been carried out for medical workers in the region in priority areas of Health care development, such as:

- ANA international standards for BLS, ACLS, PALS, PHTLS.
- triage system in the operation of the reception rooms of hospitals
- implementation of a disease management programme (DMS)
- introduction of the universal progressive model of patronage service (UPMPS) according to the WHO programme
  - development and improvement of communication skills
  - individual nursing reception
  - integrated management of childhood illnesses
  - emergency conditions in obstetrics

In total, in 2019, with the active interaction of teachers of the NJSC Asfendiyarov KazNMU, 1259 specialists were trained, including 553 doctors and 706 construction and installation work in EKR. Since November 2019, a branch of the NJSC Asfendiyarov KazNMU has been operating on the basis of the college, which organizes advanced training and retraining of doctors of the region according to requests from medical organizations of the region. During this period, 316 doctors were trained through the branch. There is an annually approved work plan, according to which activities and training are carried out. Thus, we have obtained evidence of compliance with Standards 2, 4, 6, 8.9.

Further, a meeting of EEC members was held in the presence of a foreign expert online following the results of an external assessment for compliance with the ECAQA Standards of Institutional Accreditation for Medical and Pharmaceutical Specialties of Technical and Vocational Education (TVE). A final discussion of the results of external assessment, study of documents, results of interviews, interviews, questionnaires was held. The members of the EEC began to design the final report of the EEC. EEC members made generalizations of the results of the external assessment college andConformity assessment of the college according to ECAQA's "Institutional Quality

Profile and External Evaluation Criteria for Compliance with the Standards of Institutional Accreditation of Technical and Vocational Education Organizations". The above document was individually completed by each member of the EEC. No comments were made by the EEC members (Attachment 1).

Improvement recommendations for the college discussed. A draft report and a recommendation for improving the organization's performance were prepared. The chair held a final open vote on college recommendations and a final vote on recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council.

The programme and schedule of the external expert assessment of the EEC has been completed in full.

On the part of the college staff, the participation of all persons indicated in the programme is ensured.

#### 3.2 Results of the survey of key stakeholders

The ECAQA observer conducted an online survey of college students on the resource https://webanketa.com/ from April 7-9, 2021. In total, the proposed questionnaire contains 39 questions, including an assessment of satisfaction with training and resources of the organization. The total number of students to whom the questionnaire was sent is 499. The total number of respondents is 499.

By specialties: "Medical care" qualification "Feldsher" - 44.2%, qualification "Midwife" - 10.14%, "Hygiene and Epidemiology" - 23.91%, "Nursing" - 19.57 %, "Laboratory diagnostics" - 15 "Pharmacy" - 2.17%. Fully agree with the statement that they will recommend college as an organization of training - 86.23%, partially agree with this statement - 10.87%, disagree with the statement 0%, doubted the answer 2.9%. Programme managers and teachers are aware of the problems of students associated with studying in college - 86.96% of respondents strongly agree, 9.42% - partially, strongly disagree - 2.17%, the rest doubted the answer - 1.45%. According to 84.06% of respondents, programme managers and teachers constantly involve students in the work of advisory bodies, the rest answered differently (they do not involve - 2, 17%, I do not know anything about it - 9.42%, doubted the answer - 0.72%, sometimes 3.62%). Fully satisfied with the conditions and equipment of classrooms, college auditoriums 84.78% of respondents, partially satisfied 12.32%, not satisfied 0.72%, partially dissatisfied - 1.45% and doubted with the answer 0.72%.

The college has created conditions for students to rest and eat (recreation areas, benches on the territory, buffet) in between classes - 79.71% agree completely, the rest of the respondents are not satisfied to some extent. Office equipment (computers, laptops, printers) are available for students in classrooms and practice bases are fully available for 86.23% of students, partially for 7.25%, not available for the rest of the respondents. The majority (88.41%) answered that teachers provide students with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes. In the opinion of 87.68% in the college there is access to the participation of students in research work, 6.52% partially agreed with this, and the rest - 2.17% deny it. Fully and partially satisfaction with library resources 89.13% and 10.87%, respectively. The majority (91.3%) have access to electronic educational resources. The availability of medical services for a college student is characterized as sufficient by 89.86% of surveyed students. 89.86% are completely satisfied with the activities of mentors, curators and tutors, partially - 5.8%, are not satisfied in one way or another - 4.34%, 0% do not know their mentor / curator. College teachers and staff treat students with respect - 95.65% strongly agree. Most of the respondents (90.58%) know that the college has and is implementing social programmes to support students, and 9.42% have not heard and do not know about it. The college has a career counseling service for students know about this - 87.68% of respondents. Fully agree that the college has established a system of self-study of students / pupils 86.23%, partially agree - 10.87%, the rest of the respondents disagree (2.9%), or doubted the answer. 76.09% of the respondents assessed the organization of training at the practice bases as excellent, 15.22% as good, 2.9% as satisfactory, 2.17% as unsatisfactory, and a considerable percentage of respondents - 3.62% - could not rate at all ... Approximately 84.06% of respondents answered that there is sufficient time in college for practical training (patient management and care, nursing rounds, work in laboratories, etc.), the rest or partially agreed with the answer (13.04%) either disagree (2.17%) or doubted the answer (0.73%). unsatisfactory - 2.17%, and a considerable percentage of the respondents - 3.62% - could not evaluate at all. Approximately 84.06% of respondents answered that there is sufficient time in college for practical training (patient management and care, nursing rounds, work in laboratories, etc.), the rest or partially agreed with the answer (13.04%) either disagree (2.17%) or doubted the answer (0.73%). unsatisfactory - 2.17%, and a considerable percentage of the respondents - 3.62% - could not evaluate at all. Approximately 84.06% of respondents answered that there is sufficient time in college for practical training (patient management and care, nursing rounds, work in laboratories, etc.), the rest or partially agreed with the answer (13.04%) either disagree (2.17%) or doubted the answer (0.73%).

More than 89.13% of the respondents are satisfied with the schedule of classes in the disciplines of the educational programme, partially - 7.97%, no - 2.9%. Fully and partially satisfied with the methods of assessing the knowledge and skills of students 85.51% and 14.49%, respectively. The content of the educational programme (list of disciplines) in the chosen specialty fully meets the expectations of the majority - 89.86%, partially - 8.7%, no - 1.45%. In the classroom, teachers use active and interactive teaching methods regularly considered by 84.78% of respondents. Sometimes - 12.32%, rarely - 0.73%, the remaining 2.17% either do not know what the question is about or doubted the answer. To the question: how often the teacher is late for the beginning of classes - 92.03% of the respondents answered that there was no such thing, 7.25% answered that sometimes, I do not know what to answer - 0.72%. According to 92, After completing classes, 75% of the students surveyed, the teachers constantly provide feedback (listens to opinions, conduct mini-questionnaires, work on mistakes), and 3.62% write that "sometimes", 1.45% answered "rarely", 2, 18% answered never. Two-thirds of the respondents - 91.3% - stated that a college teacher (mentor, curator) is an example for a student as a professional doctor, a person (ethics, communication, appearance, speech), the rest or do not agree with this - (2, 17%), doubted the answer (1.45%) and 5.08% answered "not all teachers of this college".

There is a sufficient number of patients to carry out practical activities in the chosen specialty, according to the majority - 86.96%. 87.68% of respondents like to study at this college. Experienced personally negative attitude of teachers more than 87.68% of students answered "no", 7.97% answered "it happened deservedly", 2.17% "answered yes is not fair", 2.18% answered "no answer". They are satisfied that more than 88.41% of respondents study at this particular college, partially 8.7%, do not know how to answer 1.45, but about 1.44% are either disappointed or did not know how to answer. The college leadership is available to students, according to the majority of respondents - 98.55%.

To the question "Are you currently in a scientific circle or participate in a scientific project", 71.01% answered "yes", and 18.12% - "no", the rest are in search, plan to start or do not want to do research.

93.48% of the respondents are fully confident that college allows them to acquire the necessary knowledge and skills in the chosen specialty, but 1.45% are not sure about this, 4.35% cannot yet give an answer, 0.72% want to believe it, and 0% began to doubt. 90.58% are completely satisfied with the organization of teaching in the college, partially 7.97%, 1.45% answered no.

80.43% of respondents assessed the work of the external expert commission positively, 14.49% were satisfactory, 1.45% were unsatisfactory, 3.63% doubt the answer. According to 84.78% of respondents, the accreditation of college or educational programmes is necessary, at the same time, 5.8% did not know what kind of procedure it was, 5.07% answered no, 4.35% doubted the answer. Most of the respondents answered that at different stages of preparation for accreditation, teachers involved them in different activities.

Conclusion: The external expert commission of ECAQA determined that the college has a corporate culture and ethical behavior between all participants in the educational process, as well as a developed system of mentoring and consulting students on academic and personal issues. This leads to a positive attitude of students to the place of study. At the same time, students are fully involved in the work of advisory bodies on the development of the mission, discussion of the educational programme and the educational process. High involvement of students in research work was noted. Positive feedback from social partners about the level of theoretical and practical preparedness of students during the period of industrial practice testifies to a fairly high level of quality of training in an educational institution.

**Areas for improvement:** it is recommended to continue to work on attracting students to develop research skills in specialized disciplines.

## An online survey of 60 teachers was conducted on 12-14.04.2021, the number of respondents was 60 (according to the staffing table - 60).

Pedagogical experience up to 5 years - 26.39%, from 5 to 10 years - 25%, over 10 years - 48.61%. 94.44% are satisfied with the organization of the educational process in college, 4.17% partially, 1.39% partially disagree. In college, ethics and subordination are considered by 90.28% of respondents, and 8.33% partially, partially disagree with 1.39%. Satisfied with the organization of labor and workplace in college, 88.89% of respondents are completely satisfied, 9.72% partially, 1.39% partially disagree. In the organization, there is an opportunity for career growth and development of teachers, 88.89% of respondents believe, and 11.11% - partially. In this educational organization, I have the opportunity to engage in scientific work and publish the results of research in the opinion of 88.89% of teachers. The wages are completely satisfied with 88.89%, in part with 11.12%. 94.44% of teachers are completely satisfied with the work of the personnel department and personnel policy, and partly - 5.56%. During the year 54.17% of the respondents improved their qualifications in their specialty, in the near future 41.67%. More than 77.78% of respondents characterize the microclimate in the team as satisfactory, 1.39% - unsatisfactory, 0% do not pay attention to it. 20.83% are satisfied with everything. 87.5% of respondents believe that in college there is an opportunity to be realized professionally.

Of the respondents, 88.89% believe that the students of this educational organization have a high level of knowledge and practical skills after completing the training programme, 11.11% of teachers partially agree.

When asked if the educational organization supports my participation in conferences (international, republican), 73.61% answered that travel expenses are paid, 4.17% - only travel expenses, 1.39% answered that they prefer self-financing, 2, 78% paid only the registration fee 11.11% did not contact the management about this, 6.94% did not give an answer.

Completely according to 97.22% of respondents that students have free access to patients at clinical sites and all conditions for improving their practical skills, 1.39% partially agree, 1.39% doubt the answer. For the theoretical part of the lesson, 80.56% of respondents spend up to 30% of the total time, and 11.11% of teachers spend 50% of the time, and 0% of respondents - about 70% of the time, almost 90% - 2.78%, no answer 5.55%, which changes the optimal balance of the organization of the educational process.

Fully satisfied with the level of prior training of students (residents) upon admission to training programmes 76.39% of respondents, partially - 23.61%. In response to the question about mentoring work, 5.56% wrote that they are mentors, 73.61% a curator, 8.33% a tutor, and 12.5% had no answer.

22.22% of the respondents are not involved in clinical work, and 61.11% believe that it is the optimal combination of teaching and clinical activities.

88.89% of respondents are aware that the college implements programmes of social support for teachers, 11.11% are not aware of this. The availability of the manual was assessed by 100% of the respondents. Teachers use different teaching methods.

This questionnaire is useful for developing recommendations for improving the key areas of the college's activities fully supported by 90.28% of respondents, and 8.33% partially, 1.39% did not answer.

**Conclusions:** the team has a corporate spirit and support from the management. The basic education of the entire teaching staff fully complies with the requirements for the content of student training, carried out in general, humanitarian, general professional, special disciplines and meets the goals, objectives and areas of educational activities of the college. Job descriptions of teaching staff correspond to the typical qualification characteristics of the positions of teaching staff and persons equated to them. The teachers are satisfied with the working conditions and the organization of the educational process, at the same time it is necessary to complete special disciplines with qualified teachers, to strengthen the issues of professional development.

**Areas for improvement:** Continue work to strengthen the teaching staff with masters, bachelors of clinical disciplines.

#### 3. Conclusions of the EEC on external expert evaluation

As part of an external expert assessment College for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards, members of the EEC were carefully studied and evaluated the main indicators of the educational activities of the college and the educational programme.

The information obtained by external experts during the study of the self-assessment report, preparation of a written review with recommendations for improvement, interviews with management, employees of departments, study of documentation, during interviews with administrative workers, interviews with students, teachers, employers, and questionnaires of 499 students, 66 teachers was analyzed. All the information received was compared with the data of the self-assessment report, which made it possible to ensure the reliability and validation of the provided college information and supporting documents for compliance with the above-mentioned ECAQA Accreditation Standards.

Despite the fact that in the self-assessment report of the "West Kazakhstan Higher Medical College" described his best practice in adhering to accreditation standards, during an external expert evaluation by EEC members, in addition to the 33 documents previously reviewed, additionally requested 15 documents and videos on learning resources, which made it possible to identify the conformity of the activity educational organizations to the standards of accreditation of educational programmes.

Recommendations for improving performance in implementation of the "West Kazakhstan Higher Medical College for compliance with Accreditation Standards, developed by the EEC based on the results of the expert evaluation, were presented at a meeting with the management of the college.

On the last day of the visit, members of the EEC conducted an assessment of the compliance of the Colledge according to the developed ECAQA "Institutional Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation of the College for compliance with ECAQA Institutional accreditation Standards". The above document was individually completed by each member of the EEC. No comments were made by the EEC members.

The programme and schedule of the external expert assessment of the EEC has been completed in full. From the side of the staff of LLP "West Kazakhstan Higher Medical College, participation of all persons specified in the programme is ensured.

Thus, the external assessment and the visit of the EEC members made it possible to verify and validate the data of the self-assessment report of the College in full in accordance with the Regulation on the External Expert Commission, Guidelines for external evaluation of a medical organization ECAQA education.

For the work of the EEC, comfortable conditions were created, access to all necessary information and material resources was organized. The Commission notes the high level of corporate culture of LLP "West Kazakhstan Higher Medical College", the high degree of openness of the team in providing information to members of the EEC.

4. Analysis for compliance with institutional accreditation standards based on the results of an external assessment of WKHMC and an overview of the strengths for each standard.

#### **Standard 1: MISSION AND END OUTCOMES**

The expert commission received convincing evidence that inZKVMK has a developed mission, goals and objectives, a strategic plan corresponding to the national policy in the field of vocational education. External and internal missions, vision, principles of activity and a strategic plan for the development of the college are determined in accordance with the stated goals and objectives, as well as the available resources: financial, material and technical, personnel, taking into account the needs of the market and the region represented. The collective of the college sets itself tasks to improve and improve the quality of education and the competitiveness of specialists. Development strategies were developed in accordance with QMS.07.DP.01 "Documented procedure", "Documenting information" by the working group-heads of structural divisions, discussed and approved at a meeting of the Pedagogical Council (Minutes No. 3 dated 26.12. 2017). at a meeting of the college's supervisory board, adopted by members of the National Assembly - representatives of interested parties, Minutes No. 1 of 20.06.2018, as well as the pedagogical council, which includes the main stakeholders: director, administration, teachers, parents, students, representative of the NLA "Atameken", representative of employers, Minutes of the pedagogical council No. 1 dated 02.09.2020

Planning and analysis of teaching and educational activities are all structural units available in the college. Representatives of stakeholders, from among employers, teaching staff, students, are involved in the formation and revision of the strategic plan and mission. The strategic plan and mission statement is available on the website in three languages and posted in an easily accessible place, indicating transparency and accessibility. The college focuses its activities on the formation of basic and professional competencies, a harmoniously developed personality, education of a citizen capable of posing and solving problems taking into account social, ethical, cultural, environmental factors. The end result of training in an educational programme is the formation of a competent specialist.

The college is guided by the principles of active and mutually beneficial integration with practical Health care, in cooperation with educational and medical organizations. In the strategic plan, approved by the Chairperson of the Supervisory Board for a period of 5 years, from 2017 to 2021, strategic directions for the formation of professional competence of a specialist are determined, ensuring the flexibility of educational programmes focused on the needs of practical health care, the priorities of the national health system.

The level of development of each competence is carried out through an annual survey of employers and an analysis of the level of satisfaction with new competencies and roles of nurses in the framework of the reform of the nursing service of independent work and the final control carried out by the NCIE.

<u>Documentation:</u> Strategic plan for the development of WKHMC; Work plans of the structural divisions of the college; Minutes of meetings of collegial bodies (pedagogical council, council method, QMS meetings).

#### The strengths of WKHMC have been identified, which include:

- the status of an accredited educational institution (https://www.zko-medcollege.kz/ru/);
- Higher College status;
- dividing the college's mission into external and internal with an actual focus on international and domestic needs of the health care system;
- participation of the college in a pilot programme for the introduction of applied bachelor's degree to meet the needs of the region with applied bachelors of nursing within the framework of the reform of nursing in the Republic of Kazakhstan and further successful

implementation of the programme in accordance with the Forecast plan of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan until 2030;

- broad representation in the adoption of the plan by college teachers and consumers of the educational process: practical health care, students, transparency-based and publicly available academic policy of the college;
- active and mutually beneficial integration with practical Health care;
- various types of learning outcomes...

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Out of 10 standards conform: completely-0, significantly -0, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

Standard 1: completed

There are no recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit.

#### **Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMMES**

The expert commission received convincing data that educational curricula in all 5 specialties and 7 qualifications correspond to the mission, goals, objectives and strategic plan of the college and is focused on training competitive specialists based on innovative technologies of the educational process, new forms of education in the field of medical education, development of social partnerships. The training process is carried out on the basis of normative educational and methodological, legal documents and allows for high-quality training of specialists in accordance with standards. In the specialties of TVE, students of 1-2 courses according to the State Educational Standard of Education in 2020, approved by order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated February 21, 2020 No. KR DSM-12/2020.

The college uses modern methods - innovative teaching technologies, active teaching methods: role-based teaching methods, preclinical imitation teaching, problem-situational learning, developing learning technologies, information, student-centered methods, design method, "Case technologies", "Problematic learning technologies », CBL, TBL, PBL, RBL, CLIL, BOPPPS, QR-cod, SMART and others, which enable students to fully master professional competencies.

When implementing the EP, WKHMC provides integration both vertically, taking into account interdisciplinary connections, pre-requisites and post-requisites for the studied subject, and horizontally, within one or different modules, pursuing the final results in the form of basic and professional competencies. The content of the industrial (clinical) and professional (pregraduation) practice meets the requirements of the State Educational Standard of Education, working curriculum of practices, qualification requirements and is implemented in accordance with the professional competencies of future mid-level specialists, for TVE, and post-secondary levels. Practical skills are taught in classrooms, in a simulation centre and 41 medical organizations in Uralsk and EKR by 91 mentors trained by the college.

Educational work is carried out on the basis of the President's programme articles: "Looking into the future: modernization of public consciousness", strategic documents of the Republic of Kazakhstan: the Constitution of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Marriage and Family", the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education", the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On the Rights of the Child in the Republic of Kazakhstan", the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Religious Activity and Religious Associations", articles by N. Nazarbayev "Looking into the future: modernization of public consciousness", "Seven facets of the Great Steppe", the anti-corruption strategy of the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2015-2025, the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On state youth policy", the State programme "Digital Kazakhstan" and on the basis of priority directions of the Rukhani Zhagyru programme.

The teaching staff of the medical college at all structural divisions of the college and advisory bodies (NS, PS, MS, TCS, etc.) and social partners participate in the management of the EP.

The fundamentals of scientific methodology are carried out at the stage of writing theses, preparing for pre-defense and defense, publishing the best theses in a scientific and practical medical journal published by the college "Akzhaiyk medical journals" under the heading

"Evidence-based nursing practice" and through 21 subject circles, where 682 learners. To verify the results of educational programmes in the college, a feedback mechanism has been created with the labor market and employers, conducted in the form of interviews with chief nurses of medical organizations and leaders.

<u>Documentation:</u> Educational and programme documentation (curriculum, standard working curricula and programmes, individual curricula for each discipline, electronic library system EBS IPR BOOKS, contracts with clinical bases).

#### The strengths of WKHMC have been identified, which include:

teaching and learning methods that ensure the formation of students' responsibility for the process and learning outcomes, guarantee the observance of the principles of equality;

introduction into educational programmes of disciplines determined by the educational organization, taking into account the needs of the labor market;

the system of educational work of the college is aimed at forming a harmonious personality of the future professional, at instilling a new Kazakhstani patriotism, civic consciousness, a conscious attitude to learning and a healthy lifestyle;

educational training programmes with a practical focus;

introduction of credit technology and innovative teaching methods into the educational process;

educational components included in the learning process are aimed at instilling national values, the formation of patriotism and citizenship, the development of versatile interests and abilities in student, at the formation of a healthy lifestyle;

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Out of 15 of the standard conform: fully-12, significantly –2, partially –1, do not correspond –0.

Standard 2: completed

#### Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1. To systematize educational planning documentation for dual training in the specialties "Medical care", "Nursing", "Applied Bachelor's degree";
- 2. Introduce dual training on educational programmes "Pharmacy", "Hygiene and Epidemiology", "Laboratory Diagnostics";
- 3. Expand the catalog of elective disciplines, taking into account the needs of practical health care in the West Kazakhstan region, as well as the basics of scientific methodology with the principles of analytical and critical thinking for all educational programmes;

#### **Standard 3: ASSESSMENT OF STUDENTS**

The expert commission received convincing data that The college's assessment system is based on regulatory legal documents. The college demonstrates an effective continuous mechanism for internal quality assessment and examination of educational programmes by monitoring the quality of education, various types of control over the training of students. Assessment is carried out for all key end results and for all types of activities and is carried out in the college through current, midterm control, differentiated credits, intermediate and final controls in the disciplines of the specialty curriculum according to the working curriculum. Assessment of students is carried out in linear and distance formats. In a distance format, it is carried out through: direct communication between the student and the teacher online on the platforms Zoom, Skype; text and test tasks on the Smart Nation platform; SIW checks (issuing assignments to students by e-mail, Whats App messenger).

The college monitors all types of control of intermediate certification, final control, cutting of knowledge in disciplines and certification (at the elders, at meetings of the TSC, methodological, pedagogical councils). The general policy on student assessment, including the timing of the assessment, assessment criteria, methods and forms of conduct, is reflected in the syllabuses of each discipline. Syllabuses for disciplines are developed by teachers, reviewed at the TSC and approved by the college methodological council. The forms of the final control of academic disciplines correspond to the State Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the

Typical Curricula of academic disciplines, are annually discussed and approved at meetings of the TCS, UMC of the college. The EP is responsible for quality assurance that implements this PCD programme. There is evidence of the involvement of social partners in assessing the professional competencies of students, corrective action by the college staff of learning outcomes. The principles, methods and practice of assessing educational achievement are comparable to the methods of teaching and teaching and guarantee the achievement of the final results by the learners. The policy of assessing the educational achievements of students is objective and transparent, (reference guide, information stands, at meetings of the elders, TCS, through the curator and the dean's office). In the context of the transition to a non-linear educational process, the form of student counseling is academic counseling of students. (guidebook, information stands, at the meetings of the elders, TCS, through the curator and the dean's office). In the context of the transition to a non-linear educational process, the form of students. (guidebook, information stands, at the meetings of the elders, TCS, through the curator and the dean's office). In the context of the transition to a non-linear educational process, the form of student counseling is academic student counseling.

<u>Documentation:</u> Control and measuring materials in traditional and electronic format on platforms Zoom, Skype; Smart Nation; SIW checks (issuing assignments to students by e-mail, Whats App messenger); Theoretical and practical journals in paper and electronic format; Personal data of students; Grade books and statements of different years.

#### The strengths of WKHMC have been identified, which include:

the use of various forms and methods for assessing the individual progress of students (individual or group survey; interview; presentation; testing; analysis of business situations, essays, tests, etc.), conducting current and intermediate monitoring of students' progress using distance learning technologies;

the presence of a systematic approach to ensuring the competence of teachers in assessing the knowledge and skills of students;

attracting practical health workers and other external examiners to participate in the final state certification of students;

high and stable level of knowledge quality based on the results of final certification of graduates in specialties.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Out of 5 standards conform: completely-4, significantly -1, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

#### Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1. To replenish and systematize the electronic database of test items for all EP;

#### Standard 4: STUDENTS

The expert commission received convincing evidence that pcontingent formation policy students in the number of students consists of the choice of the most consciously chosen specialty. Admission of applicants is carried out at the WKHMC in accordance with the Admission Rules, developed and approved by the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan "Model rules for admission to educational organizations that carry out professional educational programmes of technical and vocational training" dated October 18, 2018 No. 578. The college uses the methods, allowing to test the suitability and ability of applicants for practical work in the middle level of health care: such as interviews, psychometric testing and writing essays.

There is a practice of accepting persons with disabilities, for which an admission quota is provided, as well as the transfer of students from other programmes and colleges.

Admission to the college is carried out by state educational order at the expense of the local and republican budget, as well as on a contractual basis. The college accepts children from low-

income families and representatives of national minorities. WKHMC controls the number of recruited students in accordance with the material and technical capabilities, educational potential of the teaching staff.

To regulate the number of admissions, the college collects direct applications from EKR medical organizations to identify the existing need for personnel and from the EKR Health Department, and also takes into account the employment rates of graduates for each qualification. The college has a system of academic counseling and support for students experiencing certain difficulties in mastering educational material, as well as academic counseling for graduate students in order to prepare for admission to a university, planning a professional career. As a support programme for college students, access to the electronic library of the West Kazakhstan Medical University named after M. Ospanov, a 5-point reading room, office equipment, as well as the necessary educational and scientific literature, including on electronic media, the electronic library system "Help for the student". There is an e-government corner of the RK egov.

In addition, since September 2020, the educational institution has been operating a hostel of IE "Hayrekeshova" for 145 places for students from other regions and rural areas. On the basis of the educational institution, a buffet for 50 places was organized for organizing meals for students.

Students, taking into account their academic performance, participation in the life of the college, achievements, are additionally supported by the WKRB RO "Industry Trade Union of Health care Workers" Senim "in the form of an additional scholarship in the amount of 20,000 tenge. Psychologist provides psychological support. Students left without parental care receive social assistance. College from year to year shows an increase in scholarship payments. There are conditions to support the health of students - a first-aid post, a typical sports hall, the necessary sports equipment and inventory, sports clubs and sections, a sports ground on the territory of the college. At the beginning of the academic year, newly admitted students are provided with guidebooks (in paper form and on electronic media); it provides information about the history, traditions of the college, internal regulations, operating hours of all services, telephone directories, information about the administration, and teachers of the department.

In the college, the educational and production department, headed by the deputy director for educational and production work, is responsible for the employment of graduates. The percentage of employment is carried out through the analysis of the SCVP, requests to medical organizations in the city and region averaged 86%. There are 26 subject circles.

To activate the work of youth self-government and develop their leadership skills in the college, the Committee on Youth Affairs functions. The student council includes volunteers of student volunteer circles "Ayaly Alagan", "Meyirimdi Zhurekter" and members of the club "Sanaly Urpak", subject circles and sports sections, dance, vocal circles, and the debate club "Azamat".

In order to motivate students who are successful in their studies and take an active part in social and cultural events, regional, national, international competitions, olympiads, scientific conferences, the college annually provides material rewards to students with excellent academic performance on a paid basis can transfer to vacancies in budget groups. Students are actively involved in the work of advisory bodies and structural divisions.

There is a detailed description of the educational work being carried out, its directions of types, methods and achievements.

<u>Documentation:</u> Materials of the selection committee (statements, orders, personal files of applicants, registration logs of applicants, minutes of meetings of the selection committee); Regulations on the provision of discounts; College Student Discount Orders; Questionnaire materials of students and employers; Photo reports of the Days of Open Doors, the work of volunteers; Employers' feedback on college graduates; Materials of the KDM (regulations on the student council, reports on the work of the student council, minutes of meetings); Annual reports on educational work.

#### The strengths of WKHMC have been identified, which include:

- conducting psychometric testing for applicants to determine their resistance to stress and professional orientation, which will further reduce students' expulsion at their own request;
- the presence of the institute of supervision as a form of adaptation and academic counseling of students in order to plan a professional career, prepare for entering a university;
- Medical College provides active assistance and support to the development of the volunteer movement, student participation in social and cultural events, regional, national, international competitions, Olympiads, scientific conferences, etc.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Out of 14 standards conform: fully - 12, significantly - 2, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0

Standard 4: completed

#### Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1. Continue and strengthen work on employment in the specialties "Laboratory diagnostics", "Hygiene and epidemiology";
- 2. Find an opportunity to organize refresher courses for graduates of the educational programme "Nursing" (ophthalmology, etc.);
- 3. To intensify vocational guidance work with applicants for EP "Pharmacy", "Hygiene and Epidemiology", "Laboratory Diagnostics".

#### **Standard 5: TEACHERS**

The expert commission received convincing evidence that incollege there is an effective system of motivation, stimulation of the activities of teachers and young teachers, professional development of teaching staff and AMP. Personnel policy is aimed at increasing the continuous professional development of teachers and increasing the effectiveness of collective efforts to implement the mission and goals of the college.

The staffing of the educational process is carried out in compliance with the qualification requirements for the leaders, pedagogical workers of the educational organization and persons equated to them, approved by Order No. 338 of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 07/13/2009 (as amended on 04/30/2020). and also according to the criteria for assessing the competence of the teaching staff and the effectiveness of the quality of teaching. Personnel policy is carried out in accordance with the College's Strategic Development Plan for 2017-2021. The management of the college on an ongoing basis analyzes the quantitative and qualitative composition of teachers, and also regularly monitors and evaluates teaching activities.

The age structure of the team is 37 years old, the average age of the college administration is 40 years. The teaching staff is formed based on the needs for the effective implementation of educational programmes, as well as on the basis of the total academic load of 1080 hours per year on the basis of the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 77 dated December 31, 2013. Document flow in terms of personnel is carried out in accordance with the requirements of the QMS ST RK ISO9001-2016.

JSC "National Centre for Advanced Studies" Orleu ", through professional internships in leading institutions of practical health care of the city and region. and etc.

There is a system of advanced training within the college - the School of the novice teacher, mentoring, self-education of teachers, participation in training seminars. College teachers, engaged in self-education, consciously self-actualizing, actively publish their work in collections of international conferences and on the pages of publications of various levels, develop textbooks, teaching aids and manuals, publish articles in periodicals, collections of materials of scientific and practical conferencesth. Over the past five years, college teachers have published 346 works, including articles in collections of conference materials - 157, publications on the pages of republican and regional publications, 189 works have been published, including: 60 teaching

materials and teaching materials, teaching aids - 63 units ...

Employee promotion occurs as a result of the replacement of new vacancies with their own, predominantly "grown" in college cadres.

Documents: Personal files of teachers; Orders for the recruitment of teachers; Work plans and materials of the SIPS; Personal data of teachers.

#### The strengths of WKHMC have been identified, which include:

a rating system for assessing the competence of the teaching staff, which is aimed at increasing the efficiency and competitiveness of the teaching staff of the college;

a systematic process of improving the qualifications of teachers, including in the form of professional training both in the Republic of Kazakhstan and abroad;

functioning of the School for the novice teacher, mentoring practice;

the use of innovative and active learning technologies: methods of role-playing games, imitation preclinical training, problem-situational learning, modular learning technology, personality-oriented method of problem learning and projects, "case technologies", "CBL", "TBL", "QR code", "SMART", "PBL", "RBL", "WEB-QWEST", "standardized patient method", business games, etc.;

availability of qualified teaching staff;

conditions for positive personal growth of teachers and opportunities for the full disclosure of the potential for making a personal contribution of everyone to the sustainable development of the college;

creating a health-saving environment for employees and students.

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Out of 4 standards conform: completely-0, significantly - 0, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

Standard 5: completed.

There are no recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

#### **Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES**

The expert commission received convincing data that the The college has a high assortment of material and technical, information library resources, methodological, scientific literature on paper and electronic media, periodicals subscriptions in the context of languages of instruction and specialties, which are constantly updated, replenished taking into account the relevance and reform of the health care system of the Republic of Kazakhstan, and are used both in college and on practical bases.

The available resources in sufficient volume meet the requirements of the SES and regulatory legal acts, correspond to the stated mission, strategic goals and are available for teachers and students of the college. There is a positive dynamics of acquisition, renewal, replenishment of material and technical resources. The college is constantly working on the development and updating of material and technical equipment, the introduction of new information technologies ineducational process. AMP Collegeimplements a policy of cooperation at the national and international levels with other educational organizations, periodically conducts teaching staff training with the involvement of domestic and foreign specialistsLithuanian University of Health Sciences (Kaunas) BN18-103, KazNMU, Carmel MedCurator Haifa, Israel, JAMK University of Applied Sciences, Finland, Samara and Orenburg State Medical University, College of RemoteandOffshoreMedicine (England) on ACLS, PBLS, PALS, PHTLS.

Search and research work of students (SIW) is actively carried out under the guidance of teachers working at various EPs implemented in the college. The management of the college is taking planned measures to strengthen the material and technical base.

<u>Documentation</u>: Invoice for the purchase of material and technical equipment (dental equipment, training simulators, computer technology, educational literature, soft and hard inventory, consumables, visual aids); Applications of the heads of the offices and the heads of the

QMS; Circle work materials (plans, photo reports, publishing materials); Agreements with international partners and work plans.

#### The strengths of WKHMC have been identified, which include:

availability of the official website of the college with information about its activities in three languages;

development of a safe environment system for students and staff (fire alarm, video surveillance, license protection, etc.);

the presence of an electronic library system;

the presence of its own training and clinical centre with a simulation centre;

a high assortment and selection of material and technical, information, library resources;

constant replenishment of mannequins and dummies of classrooms for practical training; wide coverage of clinical bach for practical training;

high employment rate of college graduates.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* **Out of** 12 standards conform: completely -7, significantly -5, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0

Standard 6: completed.

#### Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1. To continue the work on replenishing the updating of the library fund in the state and Russian languages;
  - 2. Seek funds for the purchase and implementation of the electronic catalog;
- 3. Retrofit and update the material and technical base with sports equipment, auxiliary and information and communication technical training aids.

#### **Standard 7: PROGRAMME EVALUATION**

The expert commission received convincing evidence that the assessment of educational programmes is carried out on the basis of the academic performance and quality of knowledge of students, monitoring data on the satisfaction of students, teaching staff and employers, as well as the achievements of students. To study and evaluate educational programmes in the college, there is a mechanism for reviewing and agreeing from employers, receiving feedback from students, teachers by means of questionnaires, surveys, monitoring the educational achievements of students based on the results of the current, intermediate, final certification with discussion at a meeting of the TSC, discussing the results of educational indicators for six months at the teachers' council, receiving feedback from the pre-interviewers of the SJSC representatives of social partners on the level of professional competence of graduates.

Students' knowledge and skills are assessed by discipline based on the results of half a year. Every year, a cross-section of knowledge is carried out on subjects submitted for interim and final certification with an analysis of the results. Intracollege control is carried out on the quality of teaching certain disciplines of the specialty and the state of educational and methodological documentation. Internal monitoring of the activities of the college and its divisions is carried out in accordance with internal regulations and is of a planned nature. Based on the results of the audit, the head of the audited unit develops corrective actions aimed at preventing the possibility of the occurrence of identified inconsistencies in the future. The college systematically conducts research on the expectations and satisfaction of teachers, employees, employers,

**<u>Documentation:</u>** The results of the analysis of the survey and the questionnaire of students of 1 - 3 courses; Minutes of the QMS meetings; Materials of pedagogical methodological councils, materials of VKK; Materials of anonymous surveys of employers.

#### The strengths of WKHMC have been identified, which include:

availability of a system for evaluating educational programmes through external and internal expert evaluation, feedback from employers, results of surveys of employers and students, internal and external audits;

functioning of the system for collecting and analyzing the results of feedback from teachers and students through the procedure of questioning all stakeholders; a high level of satisfaction of students with the quality of the educational process, teachers - with the results of their work;

functioning of the quality management system as a tool for identifying inconsistencies and implementing corrective and preventive measures;

conducting control sections among students with subsequent comparative analysis with the results of intermediate certification;

active participation of employers in the coordination and review of educational programmes, professional practice programmes, in the assessment of knowledge, skills and abilities of students.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Out of 10 standards conform: fully-9, significantly -1, partially -0, do not correspond - 0

Standard 7: completed

There are no recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit

#### **Standard 8: GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION**

The expert commission received convincing evidence that the current organizational structure of the college was developed in accordance with the mission, goals and objectives of the KRMC... The staff structure of the college management determines the composition of the divisions and the list of college positions (Director, deputy director, heads of departments, heads of the TSC). College units are formal groups of workers responsible for a specific set of functions. (Pedagogical council, supervisory council, methodical council, TCS, council of curators). The qualifications of the heads of structural divisions correspond to the tasks of management. There is a base of internal and external regulations governing all the main processes. The openness and availability of managers and administration for students, teachers and parents is demonstrated, responding promptly and resolving any questions that arise. The internal routine of the college is represented by a complete list of constituent, legislative documents, regulatory legal acts and instructive standards that determine the activities of an educational institution and TVE as a whole.

The college demonstrates an efficient and stable funding mechanism, planning, accountability, openness and transparency in the allocation of budget funds on the principle of publicity.

<u>Documentation:</u> College Charter; Unified plan of structural divisions of the college; Strategic development plan; Job responsibilities of employees; Regulations, recommendations; Book of records of orders; Registration book of incoming and outgoing documents; Work plans of structural divisions; Inner order rules; Nomenclature of cases.

#### The strengths of WKHMC have been identified, which include:

the college engages in constructive engagement with the health sector, community and government to help provide skilled professionals in line with community needs;

the international quality management system ISO 9001: 2016 was introduced.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Out of 11 standards conform: completely - 9, significantly - 1, partially - 1, do not correspond - 0.

Standard 8: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1. To systematize the work of the QMS

#### **Standard 9: CONTINUOUS RENEWAL**

The expert commission received convincing evidence thatwhat tothe college continuously improves the quality of the educational services provided. The goals of the college's strategic development plan are updated taking into account changes in health care needs, regulatory documents, and transformations in society. The strategic plan was revised on September 22, 2020 (Minutes No. 2 of the Supervisory Board dated September 22, 2020) to adjust the indicators. To create conditions and strengthen nursing education and the development of nursing science, the Centre for the Development of Nursing was created in WKHMC LLP. Since 2014, the college has participated in a pilot project to train applied bachelors in nursing. In 2016, the college passed the

procedure of institutional and specialized accreditation, in subsequent years, post-accreditation monitoring. In 2016 he received the status of the Higher College. Since 2021, in the specialty 0302000 "Nursing", intermediate certification in special disciplines is carried out in the format of a demo exam according to World Skills standards; and the final attestation by the OSKE method. Planning is carried out based on the results of an analysis of the existing needs of the college, taking into account current activities, in accordance with previous experience and prospects for the future. The college regularly analyzes the activities of the teaching staff, in order to eliminate deficiencies, as well as in the development of a strategy, quality policy and revision of the organizational structure and functions. Resources are continuously allocated based on ongoing analyzes for continuous improvement. Planning is carried out based on the results of an analysis of the existing needs of the college, taking into account current activities, in accordance with previous experience and prospects for the future. The college regularly analyzes the activities of the teaching staff, in order to eliminate deficiencies, as well as in the development of a strategy, quality policy and revision of the organizational structure and functions. Resources are continuously allocated based on ongoing analyzes for continuous improvement. Planning is carried out based on the results of an analysis of the existing needs of the college, taking into account current activities, in accordance with previous experience and prospects for the future. The college regularly analyzes the activities of the teaching staff, in order to eliminate deficiencies, as well as when developing a strategy, quality policy and revising the organizational structure and functions. Resources are continuously allocated based on ongoing analyzes for continuous improvement.

**<u>Documentation:</u>** Strategic plan.

#### The strengths of WKHMC have been identified, which include:

- a Mission, Vision, Strategic Development Plan for 2017-2021 were developed, including goals, objectives, activities and target indicators aimed at training competitive specialists focused on working in multidisciplinary medical organizations capable of operating in market conditions:
- to create conditions and strengthen nursing education and the development of nursing science, the Nursing Development Centre was created at the WKHMC, which includes four schools: leadership, mentors, nursing research, a volunteer club;
- the successful participation of the college in the implementation of a pilot project for the preparation of applied bachelors of nursing in accordance with the needs of the national health system;
  - creative, professional and committed to the interests of the college teaching staff;
- a high percentage of employment of college graduates in the organization of health care not only in EKR, but also in other areas;
- constant updating of educational programmes in accordance with changes in the demographic situation, morbidity structure, socio-economic and cultural conditions;
- adaptation of the intermediate certification system to the international standards of WorldSkills:
- the leading positions of the college in Republican projects and competitions the ability to establish good relations with all stakeholders (MoH RK, Akimat of EKR, HD of EKR, medical institutions)

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria*. Out of 4 standards conform: completely-2, significantly - 2 and, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

Standard 9: completed

#### Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1...Introduce digitalization at the level of the educational and clinical centre (workflow, KZUN);
- 2. Develop a regulation defining the procedure for preparation, quality assessment, development and examination of EP for social partners.

Thus, all 9 accreditation standards have been met, no inconsistencies in the fulfillment of the criteria of each of the basic accreditation standards in the process of analyzing the self-assessment report and conducting the examination as part of the tasks of the external expert evaluation programme were found.

## 5. Recommendations for improving the institutional activities of West Kazakhstan Higher Medical College:

- 1. continue to work to provide quality educational services that meet the requirements and expectations of students and employers;
- 2. to increase the level of employment of graduates for continuous annual recruitment in the specialty;
- 3. to intensify vocational guidance work with entrants according to EP 0305000 "Laboratory diagnostics";
- 4. attract students to develop research skills in special disciplines;
- 5. systematize sources of Internet resources and electronic databases for ease of use;
- 6. replenish and systematize the electronic database of test items for all EP;
- 7. continue work on replenishing and updating the library fund in the state and Russian languages, supplementing with electronic educational publications;
- 8. to equip and update the material and technical base with sports equipment, auxiliary and information and communication technical training aids;
- 9. find funds to purchase and implement an electronic catalog;
- 10. introduce digitalization at the level of the educational and clinical centre (document flow, KZUN).
- 11. systematize the work of the QMS.

#### 6. Recommendation to the ECAOA Accreditation Council

The EEC members came to a unanimous opinion to recommend the Accreditation Council to accredit West Kazakhstan Higher Medical College for a period of 5 years.

Председатель Внешней Токбергенова

экспертной комиссии

Гульмира Тельмановна

Зарубежный эксперт

Олейникова

Татьяна Анатольевна

Национальный

Кумарова

академический эксперт

Алтынай Балтабаевна

Национальный

Абжанова Жанар

академический эксперт

Солтановна

Национальный

Евдомащенко Тамара

академический эксперт

Витальевна

Эксперт-

представитель

Есляшова Дина Муратовна

здравоохранения

Эксперт-

Басеров Руслан

представитель

Бектемирович

студентов

Умарова Макпал

Наблюдатель от ЕЦА

Альдибековна

Chairperson, academic expert - Tokbergenova G.T.

Foreign expert - Oleinikova T.A.

National Academic Expert - Kumarova A.B.

National academic expert - Abzhanova Zh.S.

National Academic Expert - Kumarova A.B.

National Academic Expert - T.V. Evdomaschenko

*Expert – Representative of employers -* Eslyashova D.M.

Expert - student representative - Basserov R.B.

ECAQA Observer - Umarova Makpal Aldibekovna

#### **Attachment 1**

# Quality profile and criteria for external institutional assessment (synthesis) Of WKHMC "for compliance with the Standards of institutional accreditation of organizations of TVE

			Evaluation			
Standard	Criteria for evaluation  Number of standards = BS * / SU		Totally coincides	Significantly corresponds	Partially compliant	Does not match
1.	MISSION AND END OUTCOMES	10	10			
2.	EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMMES	15	12	2	1	
3.	ASSESSMENT OF TRAINEES	5	4	1		
4.	TRAINEES	14	12	2		
5.	TRAINERS	4	4			
6.	EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES	12	7	5		
7.	PROGRAMME EVALUATION	10	9	1		
8.	GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION	11	9	1	1	
9.	CONTINUOUS RENEWAL	4	2	2		
	Total:	85	69	14	2	

#### **Attachment 2**

## Information on the number and category of participants in meetings, interviews, interviews with members of the EEC

No.	FULL NAME.	Position
1	Irmenov K.M.	Director
2	Almagambetova G.I.	Deputy Director for SD
3	Shunaeva B.K.	Deputy Director for Practical Work
4	Almagambetova G.I.	Executive secretary of the selection committee
5	Temiralieva N.A.	Head of the department "Medical care"
6	Uteulieva D.Z.	Head of the department "Nursing"
7	Alibaeva G.A.	Head of the Department of Applied Bachelor's Degree
8	Karimova A.S.	Head of the departments "Hygiene and Epidemiology",
		"Laboratory Diagnostics", "Pharmacy"
9	Mukhambetzhanova A.S.	Head of the educational department
10	Isimova Zh.T.	Head of the TCS "General humanitarian and socio-
		economic disciplines"
11	Tarzhmanova M.A.	Head of the TCS "General professional disciplines"
12	Zhapashova I.A.	Head of the TCS "Fundamentals of Nursing"
13	V.P. Kurnoskina	Head of the TCS "Clinical disciplines No. 1"
14	Trunova – Feduleeva N.V.	Head of the TCS "Clinical disciplines" No. 2
15	Dzhidebaeva S.D.	Head of TCS "Pharmacy"
16	Sagatova G.Zh.	Head of the TCS "Hygiene and Epidemiology" and
		"Laboratory Diagnostics"
17	Sh.B. Kubieva	Deputy Director for OIA
18	Aldabergenova M.S.	Specialist in social work with students

# List of documents requested by EEC members during the period of external expert evaluation

No.	Names of documents	number
1.	Strategic plan	1
2.	Constituent documents	6
3.	Job instructions	10
4.	Regulations, rules for all structural divisions	23
5.	Personal files of students for all EP (optional)	5
6.	Personal files of teachers (optional)	4
7.	Working curriculum, Typical curriculum in all EPs and disciplines	6
	(selectively)	
8.	EMCD for all EP (optional)	4
9.	Work plans of structural divisions	5
10.	College annual work plan	1
11.	Personal data of students	25
12.	Personal data of teachers	20
13.	Name book	1
14.	Minutes of meetings of the National Assembly, administrative meetings,	4
	council method, pedagogical council	
15.	Materials of the intracollegiate council and QMS	6
16.	Teacher publications	4
17.	The book of accounting of the library fund	1
18.	Diploma works of students of the applied bachelor's degree	7
19.	Clinical base contracts	21
20.	International cooperation agreements	5
21.	Orders for personnel	3
22.	Student orders	4
23.	Invoice	6
24.	TB Log	2
25.	Dual training agreements	8
26.	Further education materials (FEM)	4
27.	SRW and student council materials	12